



KATIE HOBBS
SECRETARY OF STATE

March 25, 2022

Lindsey A. Perry, CPA, CFE
Auditor General
2910 N 44th St., Ste 410
Phoenix, AZ 85018-7271

Dear Auditor General Perry:

We have reviewed the special audit report of my office's financial and related activities associated with private, nongovernmental grant monies used for the 2020 elections. Overall, we think your report captures well the work my office undertook in 2020 to ensure that the public had accurate and timely information about the upcoming primary and general elections, as well as information regarding post-election ballot tabulation, certification, and the electoral college.

The report highlights the resources that are needed to inform the public ahead of, during, and after an election. In 2020, mis- and dis-information shared by candidates, campaigns, and via social media was rampant and confusion about voting during the pandemic only compounded the need for investments in election education. Congress made emergency funding available for states and local jurisdictions, but the legislature did not appropriate the funds, which is required in Arizona¹. A partnership with the Governor's Office allowed us to create a limited public education campaign for \$1.5 million², but when other grant funds were made available for public education for state elections' offices, we applied for and were awarded³ what we thought was needed to reach as many voters as possible.

As this report shows, our messages were broadcast and shared statewide, in multiple languages, using multiple forms of media, targeting all voters. The historic turnout in 2020 amid rampant mis- and dis-information as well as a raging public health crisis was reached in large part due to the widespread public education our office was able to do.

¹ Ariz. Rev. Stat. § 41-129("To the extent permitted by federal law, monies in the fund, other than state general fund monies, deposited each subsequent fiscal year are subject to legislative appropriation...). Arizona returned \$7,874,848 unused dollars to the federal government due to lack of appropriation by the legislature. The total amount available to the state, with match, should have been \$9,449,768.

² AZVoteSafe Program available at https://gn.ecivis.com/GO/gn_redir/T/u8gn9i2i88yd. See also Governor Ducey, Secretary Hobbs Announce \$9 Million Investment For Safe Elections Plan. (2020, July 2). Retrieved from <https://azsos.gov/about-office/media-center/press-releases/1201>.

³ The Center for Election Innovation & Research 2020 Voter Education Grant Program. Available at <https://electioninnovation.org/research/ceir-2020-voter-education-grant-program/>

We hope that this report helps demonstrate, to the legislature, the level of investment the state needs to make in voter education going forward, because all Arizonans deserve consistent access to trusted, credible, and accurate elections information directly from their election officials.

I appreciate your thoroughness and objective review of my office's use of these private grants. As I have stated all along, it was about providing timely and accurate information to eligible voters about how and when to vote safely and securely in 2020. It is imperative that we have the same opportunity to provide this information in 2022.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'KH', with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Secretary Katie Hobbs
Arizona Secretary of State



Office of the Recorder
Maricopa County, Arizona

111 South Third Avenue
Phoenix, Arizona 85003-2281
Phone: (602) 506-3535
Fax: (602) 506-3273

County Recorder Stephen Richer

March 28, 2022

Ms. Lindsey Perry
Auditor General
Arizona Office of the Auditor General
2910 North 44th Street, Suite 410
Phoenix, AZ 85018

Dear Auditor General Perry,

Thank you for your office's review of: (1) Maricopa County's procurement and use of private grant money, and (2) Maricopa County's procurement of the Dominion voting system in 2019. As your report states, the County complied with all applicable laws.

1. Maricopa County's procurement and use of private grant money.

Maricopa County won two private grants in 2020—the Center for Tech and Civic Life (CTCL) grant for \$2,995,921 and the University of Southern California, Schwarzenegger Institute (USC) grant for \$41,857.

Maricopa County procured these grants openly, publicly, and lawfully. The County approved the CTCL grant in a public meeting on October 21, 2020 and the USC grant in a public meeting on November 18, 2020. No county resident protested or challenged the use of the lawfully acquired grants.

The County also used the grant funds lawfully. Of the \$1,892,971 spent, over half went to paying the thousands of temporary workers who staff various election functions. The second and third largest expenditures were election administration equipment and polling place rentals.

In August 2021, Maricopa County returned \$1,155,576 in unused funds to CTCL.

This information has already been shared through public records requests with multiple members of the media and multiple state legislators. Nonetheless, Maricopa County appreciates your thorough review of these grant funds and the detailed information included in your audit report.

The procurement of the grants, the use of the private grants, and the return of unused funds complied with all applicable laws.

2. Maricopa County's procurement of the Dominion Voting System

In 2019, Maricopa County began the public procurement process for new ballot-building and tabulation equipment. The county issued a request for proposals; the county received three competitive bids; the county enlisted a selection committee to review the bids, and the Board of Supervisors approved the chosen vendor in a public forum. At the time, no person contested the procurement process.

The procured equipment replaced tabulators that were over 20 years old. The procured equipment allowed for faster tabulation counts, as well as other enhancements.



Office of the Recorder
Maricopa County, Arizona

111 South Third Avenue
Phoenix, Arizona 85003-2281
Phone: (602) 506-3535
Fax: (602) 506-3273

County Recorder Stephen Richer

The county followed all applicable procurement laws.

The county used the exact same procured tabulators, without incident, in five elections prior to the 2020 General Election. Without incident, the County has continued to use Dominion tabulators in each of the four elections that have occurred since 2020.

Conclusion

I took office on January 4, 2020—after the procurement of both the private grants and the Dominion tabulation equipment. Accordingly, I have no personal interest in the reviewed items.

But facts are facts. The County followed all applicable laws both in the procurement of two private grants, the dispensation of the private grants, and the procurement of the Dominion tabulation equipment.

Your report concludes the same.

Thank you for the professionalism exhibited by your team throughout the process. We appreciated your use of recognized auditing methodologies, your insistence on sticking to verifiable facts, and the nature of your interactions with the County.

This is no surprise because your office is comprised of professional auditors with the applicable credentials and work experience.

I wish all reviews of the 2020 election could have been done in a similar manner, by similarly qualified professionals. Doing so would have saved Arizona taxpayers millions of dollars and would have increased confidence in local governance.

Thank you.

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Stephen Richer". The signature is fluid and cursive.

Stephen Richer
Maricopa County Recorder



COUNTY ADMINISTRATOR'S OFFICE

PIMA COUNTY GOVERNMENTAL CENTER
115 N. CHURCH AVE., 2nd FLOOR, Suite 231, TUCSON, AZ 85701-1317
520-724-8661, FAX 520-724-8171

C.H. HUCKELBERRY
County Administrator

March 25, 2022

Lindsey A. Perry, Auditor General
Arizona Office of the Auditor General
2910 N. 44th St., Ste. 410
Phoenix, AZ 85018-7271

Re: **Special Audit of Pima County Financial and Related Information of Private, Nongovernmental Grant Monies Used for Arizona's 2020 Elections**

Dear Ms. Perry:

Pima County appreciates the opportunity to respond to the Special Audit of the Auditor General, referenced above. Additionally, the County wishes to thank your staff for its robust communication and professionalism throughout the audit, which was statutorily required by the Arizona State Legislature pursuant to Laws 2021, Ch. 408, §54. Regarding Pima County, this session law directs that:

On or before March 31, 2022, the auditor general shall submit a report to the governor, the president of the senate and the speaker of the house of representatives on . . . the following: . . . 3) Private, nongovernmental grant monies received and expended by Pima County on programs and processes for the 2020 elections, including the purpose of the expenditures, the amount spent for personnel and employee-related expenses and any balance remaining unexpended on June 30, 2021.

The only private, nongovernmental grant monies received by Pima County in relation to the 2020 elections was from the Center for Tech and Civic Life (CTCL). On October 20, 2020, CTCL notified Pima County of a \$950,446 grant award. The letter stated the overall purpose of the award as follows: "The grant funds must be used exclusively for the public purpose of planning and operationalizing safe and secure election administration in Pima County in 2020." The CTCL grant award was accepted and approved by the Pima County Board of Supervisors at its public meeting on November 10, 2020.

Ms. Perry

Re: **Special Audit of Pima County Financial and Related Information of Private, Nongovernmental Grant Monies Used for Arizona's 2020 Elections**

March 25, 2022

Page 2

Pima County is pleased to note that there are no findings in the Special Audit relating to the County's full expenditure of the CTCL grant award. Pima County also notes that it submitted all funding reports timely to CTCL and that CTCL considers all County expenditures of the grant were in full compliance with grant agreement terms and conditions.

Sincerely,



Jan Lesher
Acting County Administrator
Pima County



Gabriella Cázares-Kelly
Recorder
Pima County