



LINDSEY PERRY, CPA, CFE  
AUDITOR GENERAL

STATE OF ARIZONA  
OFFICE OF THE  
AUDITOR GENERAL

MELANIE M. CHESNEY  
DEPUTY AUDITOR GENERAL

April 30, 2018

The Honorable Anthony Kern, Chair  
Joint Legislative Audit Committee

The Honorable Bob Worsley, Vice Chair  
Joint Legislative Audit Committee

Dear Representative Kern and Senator Worsley:

Under contract with the Office of the Auditor General, Sjoberg Evashenk Consulting, Inc. completed an initial followup of the Pima Association of Governments Regional Transportation Authority Plan regarding the implementation status of the 7 audit recommendations presented in the report, *A Performance Audit of the Pima Association of Governments—Regional Transportation Authority Plan*, released in April 2017 (Auditor General Report No. 17-CR1). As the attached grid indicates:

- 4 have been implemented, and
- 3 are in the process of being implemented.

Unless otherwise directed by the Joint Legislative Audit Committee, this concludes the follow-up work on the Pima Association of Governments' efforts to implement the recommendations from the April 2017 performance audit report.

Sincerely,

Dale Chapman, Director  
Performance Audit Division

DC:ka  
Attachment

cc: Farhad Moghimi, Executive Director, Pima Association of Governments/Regional  
Transportation Authority  
Michael Ortega, City Manager, City of Tucson  
Pima Association of Governments Regional Council Members  
Regional Transportation Authority Board Members

# Pima Association of Governments— Regional Transportation Authority Plan Auditor General Report No. 17-CR1 Initial Follow-Up Report

## Recommendation

## Status/Additional Explanation

### Chapter 2: RTA Partners are Delivering Projects as Envisioned

- |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                        |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------|
| <p>1. Encourage lead agency/local jurisdictions responsible for the implementation of RTA Plan projects to consider using internal project delivery performance measures to better measure the efficiency and effectiveness of project management efforts toward meeting goals.</p> | <p><b>Implemented at 12 months</b></p> |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------|

### Chapter 3: RTA Plan Partners Should Be Able to Complete Remaining Projects

- |                                                                                                                                                           |                                        |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------|
| <p>2. Provide a range of expected revenues for the next cycle of RTA Plan revenue projections, instead of only providing one scenario as in the past.</p> | <p><b>Implemented at 12 months</b></p> |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------|

### Chapter 4: Performance on Roadways Revealed Mixed Results

- |                                                                                                                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <p>3. Improve practices related to the preparation and reporting of five-year performance assessment reports by releasing the information on a more frequent basis.</p> | <p><b>Implementation in process</b><br/>Performance assessment reporting is being improved through the new Performance Measure (PM) Dashboard the Pima Association of Governments (PAG) is developing. According to PAG, it will annually review and update available performance data for key metrics on its PM Dashboard as well as prepare summary sheets using data from the PM Dashboard for the 47 performance measures captured in its long-term 2045 Regional Mobility and Accessibility Plan (RMAP). PAG plans to update all data sets used in the PM Dashboard annually during July and August.</p>                                                                                                              |
| <p>4. Capture roadway-related data and analyze performance against recently adopted Regional Mobility and Accessibility Plan targets.</p>                               | <p><b>Implementation in process</b><br/>PAG is working on a comprehensive expansion of its data collection and the development of a PM dashboard for the 47 performance measures captured in the long-term 2045 RMAP as part of its efforts to implement the recently finalized federal performance measurement requirements. The expansion of performance data will use both modeled data and actual results from sources including, but not limited to, the National Highway Traffic Safety Administration's Fatality Analysis Reporting System, the Arizona Department of Transportation's (ADOT) Accident Location Identification Surveillance System, the National Bridge Inventory database, and the U.S. Census</p> |

## Recommendation

## Status/Additional Explanation

American Community Survey databases. Additionally, according to PAG, discussions are underway with ADOT about purchasing travel time data for all of Arizona.

As previously mentioned, PAG is developing a new PM Dashboard that will capture and analyze data by comparing current performance and historic data to interim targets and long-term goals. We reviewed the in-progress PM Dashboard and found it to be robust, clear, informative, comprehensive, and easy to navigate. Moreover, the PM Dashboard will generate a one-page summary for each of the 47 performance measures established in PAG's long-term 2045 RMAP. Each summary lists the RMAP goals, observed values, an interim target, and sources of data, process, and update schedule.

- 
5. Continue to refine performance-based planning and measurement through an iterative approach adjusting measures and targets as needed to better achieve regional goals.

### **Implementation in process**

Along with the other efforts described in the explanations for Recommendations 3 and 4, PAG will compare observed performance with mid-term and long-term goals as part of its long-term 2045 RMAP update starting in 2018, with an anticipated completion in 2020.

---

## Chapter 5: Transit Services Generally Met Targets and Outperform Peers

---

6. Standardize reports and regional comprehensive performance reporting for Sun Tran, Sun Link, Sun Van, and Sun Shuttle transit services to make it easier for taxpayers to identify transit performance outcomes.

**Implemented at 12 months**

7. Develop performance targets for Sun Shuttle neighborhood and dial-a-ride paratransit service for areas such as ridership, service coverage and frequency, and total expenses and revenues in addition to the targets for system reliability and passenger safety currently included in operator contracts.

**Implemented at 12 months**

---